The Metropolitan Complex

Roundtable Discussion

Bassam El Baroni, Pip Day, Lívia Páldi, Milica Tomić, and Sarah Pierce.

On Tuesday 15 December 2020, the following conversation took place over Milica Tomić Sarah, may I ask you something that the video conferencing service Zoom between Helsinki, Berlin, Vienna and relates to 'context': Why are you recording this Dublin. The conversation was recorded, and has been transcribed and edited. There was no audience present.

paper is that usually I gather people in a studio then? What is the purpose? You had mentioned at the This time we're all in different places. Pip is in will record in order to document this conversation, Berlin, Bassam is in Helsinki, Milica is in Vienna, and that there is no copyright or authorship to Lívia and I were thinking about for this paper in much about a horizontal collective exchange and particular was to reach out to people who, like us, contribution, but also about the performative aspect find themselves living in places other than the place of this conversation. So, I am asking again: Why they are 'from'. While there is a virtual location/ then record? What is the purpose? dislocation in terms of how everyone is working in the pandemic, hovering over this conversation are Sarah Pierce Obviously, yes, on one level, it's questions about being 'of' a place, not necessarily pragmatic. But in terms of the larger question that in a nativist way, but because it is a ground for I think you're asking, the reason I record these your work or your project, right now. Lívia, is conversations and then transcribe them is to stake a there anything you want to add?

about location/dislocation over the years. I've been people gather for a talk, a panel or other type of here in Dublin for four years and I'm leaving in formal presentation, when it's over, everyone meets March, temporarily moving back to Budapest. So, for up afterwards. Usually in Dublin it's at a pub. It's me, one of the questions is the transferability of not unique. But this casual, immediate response is specific experiences, whether it's an experience of a how the real talk takes place, and we learn what's at specific political or social context, or the different stake and what people's investments are. Through the ways you actually develop yourself through different Metropolitan Complex papers, I wanted to pay closer contexts and then come across problems that you want attention to these types of exchanges, because I to do something about. But then you have to learn the think they're important. They matter in terms of hard way that some lines of interest and approach to what we're doing. By transcribing a conversation problems it might not fit that 'new' context. I've that takes place without an audience, it raises the had two positions as a curator with this type of stakes. First of all, as I transcribe I have to really set four-year contract. The rest of you might have listen and attend to what was said. And, of course, had some similar experiences, where, by the time Milica, you're right: as soon as these conversations you realize certain things about the place you're circulate as published papers, they become something in, you need to move on. One of the interesting else, with a different aura. They have a different understandings of this situation - plus the pandemic, palette, a formality and a performativity different plus a lot of other things - has been questions around to a conversation. political unrest and the different fascisms we face that also make us re-evaluate certain relations to Milica Tomić I'm just thinking now. There is this specific historical periods and cultural-political wonderful book by Peggy Phelan, Unmarked, and this experiences. It might sound like a bit of a mixed chapter 'The Ontology of Performance: Representation bag, but that's all in it when you're leaving a place without Reproduction' where she writes about the or context, and figuring out how things might have ontology of performance, discussing the boundaries of happened in a different way, and also going back to performance, the labour involved, its representation a place, Hungary, which has again featured a lot in and modes of public address. When does performance the news in the last few weeks. Obviously, not in a begin? What are the different forms of labour involved good way. What kind of experience can I bring back? in its production? When does it actually end? She I hate using this word 'useful', but it's kind of argues that this live moment of the performance an extended way of talking about usefulness in the has to be unrecorded and, if so, there might be a sense of adequacy.

on the terms you've raised, Lívia. You mention thus is that which disappears. She says that there transferability and how that perhaps relates to are no leftovers of performance: 'It saves nothing,

context, and whether context is even relevant anymore. Should we be talking about something other than context, like atmosphere or conditions?

conversation?

Sarah Pierce So that I can transcribe it.

Sarah Pierce OK, so what's different about this Milica Tomić Yeah, but why do you transcribe this, somewhere and we hold the conversation in person. very beginning, before you started recording, that you and Livia and I are in Dublin. One of the things this conversation, which also means that it is very

critical claim on other ways of producing a discourse around cultural work. It's incidental, but something Lívia Páldi I've had a lot of discussions with Sarah I noticed when I moved to Dublin is that, when

possibility to have another, unexpected development of what happened. She also thinks that the locus of Sarah Pierce Maybe to get started we can focus performance lies in the live moment: performance

it only spends'. It produces blind images and non- commodification. I think there's an ontology to the static objects, which cannot be caught on media. paper that is equally resistant. It is limited, it For me, this all relates to this particular moment runs out, it is not transacted as precious, and of our conversation now. So, I wonder: What are its failure as a documentary object frustrates it the effects of an unrecorded discussion, and how being understood as anything other than mediated/ should we consider events and memories that cannot mediation. participate in the circulation of representation? For art institutions, the recorded document (paper) Milica Tomić I am not against recording and the plays a crucial role. If it is not there, space paper per se, but it is important to go back to is opened up, which allows for thinking outside Phelan, I think, especially if we discuss the notion the logics of the existing institutions and their of context in this conversation. hierarchical order. Do we allow this by recording this conversation, now?

Sarah Pierce Well, the book is called Unmarked because Bringing us back to this idea of transferability, Peggy Phelan understands, too, that the writing of the questions that are asked when we find ourselves performance marks it. She writes and she marks; it in different places or contexts or situations is not about remaining silent. It is to write in however we want to think about this - are shared ways that attend to what is unmarked and unclaimable questions that institutions ask, that artists ask. through representation. That's what I mean by 'staking The answers returned tell us something about where a claim' on conversations that don't perform within we are. What I'm hearing you get at, Milica, is that the space of official talks, and therefore leave no we can't ignore the atmosphere we're in right now, institutional trace. It's actually very connected in terms of gathering and having a conversation like to the unmarked. When this conversation circulates, this. It's not a given. it's changed, it's different, we've marked its difference.

Bassam El Baroni Philosophically, it's a very relationship of the document to the real, to come interesting point of discussion, because if we take back to this term? I have an anecdote as well from is not on an equal footing in terms of the real. who's just edited a book of Audre Lorde's Europe While I understand that kind of mental operation, the years, and who has an interesting relationship to - in what way does that absence make that experience and what we record, and in it Mayra presents not just more real, or touch the real? This is an interesting Lorde's texts and letters of the moment. She also philosophical question that I don't have an answer brings in other archival material to contextualise, for, but I think it needs further interrogation.

Milica Tomić Phelan thinks that 'not recording' is ponder upon this, in relation to our current context methodologies of her choosing. Our first conversation non-physical presence, has a lot of sense, I think. Our conversation opened up to a history that I was It's interesting to think about what kind of future unfamiliar with, in that enslaved people in Colombia If we live now, at a moment of the total distraction scribes. Their labour, - one of their many labours of society, you know, I am interested to think about was as scribes. So my invitation to her unwittingly the 'not recorded'.

secondary activities, which relates to some of what documenting. Phelan is interested in, in terms of not tracking everything through what can be bought and sold, Sarah Pierce That's key - and I like this metapackaged or documented, but to instead think about chat about the conversation that we've entered into,

Sarah Pierce I appreciate that. You should always ask, 'Why are you recording?' It's a good question.

Pip Day And what do we then do with this sort of document? If the document needed? What is the what Milica was saying, then we're sort of saying a recent workshop I was running in Berlin. Instead that the 'real' is the unrecorded, right? And that of proposing that we record the workshops, I worked the recorded is a performative moment that somehow with poet-writer-translator Mayra Rodríguez Castro, question is to what degree is the absence of tools, the document, having spent much time in the archive. the absence of the eye of a camera or the microphone That book is itself a record and is also about how to add layers, to people the book with other voices, and also to move away from this notion that we can ever get at the real. For the workshop, Mayra was invited the means of redesigning relations within society. To to generate a written response, or to 'record', using (pandemic crisis), the time of total surveillance on about what kind of form her response could take the one hand and, on the other, the time of the demise also addressed what was implicated in that role and dissolution of society in general, through this as an Afro-Colombian writer being the note-taker. this conversation could have, by not being recorded. were actively taught to write and read, and became called up this whole other history. This comes into play, in oblique ways, in Mayra's response, or the Sarah Pierce What if the paper is a performance, product that she made, which is a blog that both is with the conversation, that includes its moments and is not at all a document of this six-week-long of inscription, the transcribing, the editing, the gathering of folks in Berlin and that does not at printing and the circulating? There's value in these any point camouflage the subject-position of the one

performance as resisting or resistant to its own unexpectedly. There's something about using the

document circulates and what is done with it also has ways that, ten years ago, it wouldn't have been. to do with what is irreproducible as documentation on the one hand and transacted as a 'real document' Sarah Pierce I'm hearing the word 'authentic' in on the other.

Pip Day Yes.

Long pause

Sarah Pierce So that's a wrap!

Pip Day Thanks, everyone!

Bassam El Baroni Ha, yes, I don't know if we'll the implication that this is scandalous when it's in continue the rest of the conversation on this meta- fact really banal. It's a weird affect in relation level, but just one more thing is: if we take this to the recorded document, this need for a necessary point and push it to its ultimate conclusion, it's marker that something took place, and otherwise it implying that solitude or non-communication offers never happened. And I think you're right, Bassam: something realer about it than communication. And I ten years ago it was different. don't think that's the case. It's hard to argue that is the case, right? Because even in solitude - and Bassam El Baroni The complexity of the question of it is interesting to think about that - I mean, I truth at this particular moment in history that has don't think it's the case, but it's interesting as emerged over past five, six years is really pivotal. something that appears when a particular industry or It's part of this challenge. economy, or life in general, is driven to communicate excessively. We can use Jodi Dean's concept of Sarah Pierce Not to completely shift gears, but 'communicative capitalism', for example, as a maxim thinking about all of us and how we work, we're all here for thinking about this, heightened by this very connected to a younger generation. I'm curious, ongoing crisis, and the fact that communication in in relation to these ideas, in terms of truth effect, one way has been accelerated, but not necessarily credibility, legibility and the recorded document in a positive way. It's tempting to think that an - What do they know that we can't know? Pip, you anti-communicative stance is somehow more authentic. mentioned the work you were doing in Berlin and But I don't know if that's the case. I don't have a decisions around recordings. There is a familiarity position on that, but I'm questioning that position. with the recorded document and also a relationship One thing we might need to acknowledge is the drive to it that makes it innocuous for a generation that to be more specific and more considerate about things, is savvy, and who's possible retort to the question through having access to more local knowledges and all 'Why record?' would be: 'We are always recording!' sorts of areas of expertise, and the vast expansion I'm interested in that way of knowing. I'm interested of the field through the inclusion of people from in what the 'always recorded' subject knows. What do different areas, backgrounds, disciplines, knowledge they know? bases that were previously filled in by figures like the curator, for example. People tend to be more Pip Day Well, what do they know? To come back to the careful, tend to be more cautious, of where they to the recent workshop in Berlin, the participants tread. I think that's good. It's a positive thing, completely rejected having any photographs or But it's also a sign of the way the general economy recordings of the sessions - the document was not is going. I'm talking here about the general economy at all innocuous - and the performativity among in a wider sense, not just in a financial sense - the themselves was really something else. As a group knowledge economy and so on. The sense that there is of Berlin-based, first- or second-generation, early more specialism, but that specialism, in one way, career practitioners, there was an everydayness as far as what people were doing in the '90s and up to the performativity, which had a lot to do with until the first decade of the 2000s, was much more staking claims to, let's say, activist positions, or intuitive. You could fill in the gaps. I think now few tear-down-the-institution credentials, right? But people dare to do that. Even through their research. the resistance to recording was really a resistance What does it mean to have a research profile, for to the institutional uses of the recording. They example? You have to align to specific tendencies were rejecting or anticipating that the white and subjects and topics. Yes, of course, topics get institution would take these photographs and then overloaded, and we see certain trends emerging and splash these photos of all the POC participants in

document as evidence of the visible-real, to go so on. But there is a growing awareness that you back to Peggy Phelan, where she cautions us to not can't fill in all the gaps. You need to reach out to hold on to the visible-real as a truth effect for people who have more specific knowledge, and you need what took place. There is a disconnect. The paper to include people from different areas of specialism is not documentation. It's a different thing. It's and different knowledge backgrounds. All this makes Other. What you were saying, Pip, too, about how the this particular kind of conversation challenging in

> relation to truth - and this isn't necessarily something I want to bring in - but for the sake of thinking about the document further: the claims of fraud in the recent US election relied exclusively on a mediated understanding of truth. So, you're looking at a video of a room in Philadelphia where votes are being counted and someone is narrating, 'There's a woman taking a suitcase out from under a table, and she's taking ballots out of the suitcase, and, look, there you can see she's counting the ballots', with

the workshop across social media, and this would be who talks about atmosphere as alternative to thinking used to gain cultural capital and to claim itself as about situated understandings of context. What you as a 'documenter'.

classroom situation.

chatted recently, and we discussed that you also have context matter for a younger generation? worked a lot with younger generations of artists, researchers and curators. So, it would also be Lívia Páldi I'm curious about that too. interesting to hear about see the specific projects that you have collaborated on; it's a very different Sarah Pierce I suppose it's OK for us to not know kind of collective work.

Milica Tomić Can you be more specific?

would respond to specific questions. Space the pandemic.

institutionally diverse - or I think the language were just saying, Milica, is evocative - having one's here is 'inclusionary'; it's still stuck at that term context change overnight without moving, without here. As quite a young group living in a world in which going anywhere, and that change as something that can everything is documented, surveilled and shared, it be inventoried. I'm trying to connect that to what was clear that countering their instrumentalisation Pip was describing in terms of a very performative by the institution was where their resistance lay. moment that some of the group understood they were And they were also initially suspect of Mayra's role in. Perhaps instead of context we can think about the atmosphere we are working in right now. Pip and I were living in New York in the '90s, and you couldn't Sarah Pierce Were they recording on their own devices? escape the idea of context as somehow performative. Remember when Scandinavia was the sexiest place Pip Day I don't know. Maybe. This is pretty standard to be from as an artist? Or how the collective now, in classroom situations, but it wasn't a was performed? There were real differences between Superflex and Group Material, for example, in that each practice arose out of and reproduced context Lívia Páldi I would also ask - because, Milica, we as work. I'm wondering how that plays out now? Does

how it plays out.

Bassam El Baroni In terms of context, it's important in these moments that Milica was describing, in some Lívia Páldi I just wanted to ask you to talk about your contexts, in some places, in this particular moment, ways of working within a research situation, let's that the general milieu wasn't a shaping milieu, in say in Graz. When you work on a very specific project, the sense that what existed at that particular moment for example for the Steirischer Herbst festival in wasn't something that people wanted to be identified 2018 [Exhibiting on a Trowel's Edge. Research and with. So, if I'm talking about the context of Cairo, investigative processes of Aflenz Memorial in becoming, or Egypt in general in the late '90s, a lot of the Forum Stadtpark], which was very much connected to people there ... Of course their work was contextual, a specific site in Austria with different layers but I'll describe that in a different way. It wasn't of history. I'm curious how the younger generation like they felt they were shaped by the context that they were in, because a lot of people didn't feel Milica Tomić To discuss the younger generation's that this was an interesting context in terms of the response to different contexts? Maybe I can go back general approach to artistic practices or a particular to the times when I was 'the young generation'? It politics, because of all sorts of subtle things that goes back to your invitation, and Sarah's project, are difficult to describe. The educational context organising conversation related to 'context' and and pedagogical concepts that people emerged from then exposing these often hidden parameters of were very different. It wasn't the kind of context every collaboration. I can't think of anything that that would be inspiring for a challenging artistic better depicts my experience concerning the change practice to emerge from. In a way, the practices, ideas of context and how powerfully it defines us than and ways of doing that arose in these environments this: The time of the demise of Yugoslavia, with emerged against the context, in friction with the war and the constitution of new nation states, at dominant context. I think this is often overlooked. the very beginning of my artistic life. I was born I'm not claiming at all that this was born out of and living in Belgrade, and it was the capital of nothing - that's not what I'm trying to elaborate. Socialist Yugoslavia. The change of context was so But, in some places, when I started travelling early sudden that our existential context changed literally on at the beginning of my career and coming into overnight. Everything was different. I went to bed contact with artists who emerged from a milieu, it in Yugoslavia, didn't move an inch, from my home or felt really strange. The moment of the late '90s my room, but when I woke up in the morning, I stepped and to be clear, I'm not saying that there weren't out of my bed into country called Serbia. It wasn't any interesting artists practising before that - but just a different context, it was another state, with there wasn't a comfortable milieu that you could an unknown anthem and an uncanny flag. Everything was somehow acknowledge as being part of a particular completely different. Today I have the same feeling lineage or heritage. I think that was the feeling of with the changes we are experiencing in relation to many people working at the time. The feeling was a certain mode of friction with the contextual, with the idea of context specificity in the sense of not Sarah Pierce Kathleen Stewart is an anthropologist having to commit to belonging to a context shaped

'politically correct', which came to be used as a 'Oh, yeah, this is identity politics', as a way to

around democracy and its usage as a platform where the political right has emerged in artistic practice. to what its ethical centre is, it's a democracy of equivalence that makes any point of view - if The original idea was basically that you give people money without doing work for it, then just leave them alone and don't develop the infrastructures of care, and let them depend on themselves through a kind of

urban space was already an extremely bold strategy my deep interest in the incommensurable, or that

by the infrastructures of the past. That's how a Sarah Pierce I guess it's an example that foreshadows new context began to emerge. But it was always in a moment we find ourselves in now. Hannah Black was friction; it was a constant friction. I think that calling out the use of an image and connecting this friction still remains today and is part of a healthy to context, but also I would argue to an atmosphere creative environment, even though there is a lot - of protest, of violence, of violation. It may not perhaps too much - holding back that environment. be the best example, because I'm also talking about What I'm trying to say is that context is important, general politics that is decontextualised and somehow but when we're talking about the emergence of an art only locatable within a visible, outward projection scene or particular outlook, it's not everything. of identity. And, actually, sometimes a problematic context or a context seen as problematic - can be just as Bassam El Baroni Yeah, this example, or the example

circulating in the late '90s, a term that seemed fixed in relation to context is 'identity politics'. There's been a mostly unreconstructed return to all think about that?

of revival of identity politics, not just in art but purpose is to depreciate and devalue institutional in general.

too sensitive?

specifically what she means?

Bassam El Baroni Yeah ... ?

when we think about context.

Sarah Pierce I'm guess I'm thinking about an alignment thinking about the larger idea of identity politics with politics that has to do with visibility on one and its history within artistic practices is by for one's context. OK, for an example, maybe I would 'globalism' or the much maligned idea of 'global art' Whitney Biennial in 1993, which was curated by Thelma are intellectual needs, they're philosophical needs. Golden, with works like Daniel Martinez's I Can't And because that's where the money is, of course. was the particular moment with a painting by Dana only function, by a kind of surrendering to a global spectacle of - depending on the argument - Emmett perceived as being from outside those centres argues the painting to be destroyed. That a white painter that isn't just depicted as a map of provincialisms market was reprehensible to many.

imply with these particular cases?

generative as a continuation of a particular milieu. of an anti-racist trajectory that is intertwined with I think that's important to take into consideration the context of US politics, when we're talking about identity politics in relationship to that, it's a very different thing than talking about how identity Sarah Pierce Thinking of some vocabulary that was politics operates in the expanded field of art at large. Because there's a very specific, vernacular fight that is going on in your example, and its sites change, but the fight continues. In a way, more nuanced identity politics recently, and I'm curious what you arguments emerging from philosophical, theoretical and artistic semantics, conceptualisations and ethics are irrelevant and will be pushed to the side, because Milica Tomić You're right: there has been some kind they interfere with the bigger picture. The fight's racism per se, so it extends everywhere: to the museum, to the streets, and so on. But when we Bassam El Baroni Can we be more specific? Or is it say identity politics at large, then there's a different dynamic. 'Identity politics' - somehow this terminology isn't sufficient today. It's lacking. I Milica Tomić You mean that Sarah explains more don't know what it's lacking exactly. Maybe it's a specific capacity to express the different scales and different encounters where the political intersects with the site of art and the context of art, and vice versa. One text that I appreciate in terms of level. That's nonspecific. I suppose I'm wondering David Hodge and Hamed Yousefi, called 'Provincialism about how one's investment in certain conversations, Perfected', which turns the whole idea of global art how they take place and disseminate, seems to be on its head. It's saying that that the major aesthetic read as a visible identity politics. Which connects component of modernism was provincialism, and that to what we were talking about in the beginning of extended into contemporary artistic practices and this conversation, where visibility is the truth the so-called global art scene. I don't know if effect for one's investment, for one's connection, we can even use that term anymore. The sense that cite the 2017 Whitney Biennial in New York, where was a series of reinforcements of provincialisms identity politics played out very differently to the according to the needs of the centres. These needs Imagine Ever Wanting to Be White. In 2017, there So, the idea of inclusion could only work, could Schutz's that depicted, or commemorated, or made a map of provincialisms. In that sense, when a person Till's open casket. The artist and writer Hannah for a universality, it's not accepted, because it Black's response was an open letter calling for seems universality or a global, wider idea of inclusion could paint this image and have it circulate, and is not accepted. Even though someone in the US or - whether the painting is for sale or not - that it in the UK, or wherever, might have written a text would exist in the context of capital and the art against universality, it's still the case that such concepts are the stronghold of the West. You're not supposed to - as person from the so-called periphery Bassam El Baroni Sorry, so what are you trying to - have a claim to it. You have to be provincial. From that perspective, there's a conversation that we're not even allowed to have. That's annoying, because Sarah Pierce What you were saying, Bassam, about the identity politics. I'm thinking about ways where frustration of not being able to have a conversation the historically 'transformative' identity politics that we want to have, as well as thinking that - to refer to what you said earlier, Sarah - is we're having a conversation that we're not having, maybe shifting into a 'strategic' one? Similarly to reminds me of something Paul Gilroy notes about the global politics of the art world. At a certain point, pejorative, now there's this white tendency to say, according to Gilroy, the image of the veiled woman started to appear in art, and it made people think a dismiss and erase the transformative history and conversation about women and religion and politics potential of identity politics. was taking place. This image was present, but the conversation wasn't happening - at all. Is identity Bassam El Baroni Angela Dimitrakaki edited an issue politics the particularisation of interests, or a of Third Text, where she contributed a long essay universality of interests?

Bassam El Baroni The problem with the word She argues that we're in what she calls a 'democracy 'universality' is that it's not the right word, of equivalence'. There's actually no neoliberal because it is so loaded. It's really more about democracy that has a strong ethical centre in terms 'transformability'. Is it possible to think towards of what politics is - the centre is empty. This is transformability - like having a conversation, having what people like Chantal Mouffe argue for, but they a dialogical approach towards things that would end try to radicalise it to the left. In that void as up transforming things instead?

Sarah Pierce Right. Identity politics, on the one argued, or rather disseminated and mythopoeticised, hand, is about trying to forge a place for new hard enough - valid. It's a 'winner takes all' kind subjects in the world that aren't represented within of democracy. We're sometimes surprised: 'Oh, this the hierarchies and systems available to us, versus is actually a leftist idea, but it's been adopted by an identity politics, on the other hand, that is the right wing'. And there are also right-wing ideas about securing a place for subject identities that that have been adopted by the left. For example, the already exist. No matter what those are. Maybe that's recent conversation around universal basic income, a difference. It's not that one understanding is which is a core neoliberal idea. The original good and one is bad - it's a difference in terms of neoliberals developed that as negative income tax. a shared project.

Bassam El Baroni Yes, exactly.

Pip Day I'm really interested in this configuration, free market, and everything will be OK. Now its seen Sarah, especially at this very specific moment of more as a leftist idea, because it's been rethought identity and political formations. Having recently and reappropriated. All of that happens within what moved to a new place, being new to Europe, I still Dimitrakaki calls this democracy of equivalence. Of feel ill equipped to address what form identity course, I'm surprised, too, about what's happening, politics is taking here, while continually being but somehow, we shouldn't be surprised, because the exasperated and shocked at the context, which I limits of the democratic model we have all point shouldn't be I guess, of Germany and Berlin. I live towards these emergences. It feels like it's almost now a block from Rosa-Luxemburg-Platz and to see a natural progression of what this kind of system the ways - of course, this has been happening for would lead up to in a hypermediated world. some time - but the very clear ways during the pandemic, following the emptying out of the public Sarah Pierce If we exclude my rambling introduction sphere or public space in Berlin, the ways the when we first joined this online meeting, we're now vacuum created during the pandemic has been filled at an hour of conversation. A lot has been said. I here. For example, by the right-wing populists and want to suggest that we wrap up, but I'm also aware extremists who are using terminology of the left and that it feels like we've just started. Nothing has of identity politics. These strategies are deepening to be resolved, but if there's last comments, or if here in Germany. As I understand it, the early right- anyone feels there's something they didn't get a wing protests here on Rosa-Luxemburg-Platz, the very chance to say or raise, we can raise it, and then early ones in the pandemic, were also peopled by it's there for whoever picks up this paper. leftists, those who took the site itself - Rosa-Luxemburg-Platz - as an indicator of the leanings Pip Day On a last note, Lívia, to come back to of the protest, and so occupying that particular your question about transferability, I would mention

in of potentially leftist positions into the right's to break down. strategies. There's a parallel with language around

there's something about inequality there in terms of of the right. And then the language they used around

communication that's problematic. It's very difficult democracy, around anti-surveillance, and the folding

embracing the 'incommensurable' as a practice is a thing that I carry or that I am trying to carry with me. Maybe this is a transferable practice: to engage deeply with place-specific incommensurables.

Lívia Páldi That's great. I was simply listening, because there's so much to address. I think a lot about moving contexts, where certain knowledges or approaches might not work because of the lack of vocabulary and space, or simply not being ready or interested in discussing many of the things we talked about. What we were not able to discuss further here is instituting, as an important question to consider, whether we work or don't work for specific institutions: How do you reclaim the public space, or create spaces, for discussions such as this one? Also, Sarah and I have discussed institutional practice a lot, and what it means when you have a physical space that you might not be able to use, as has been the case at Project since last year. And if you do, what if that physical space doesn't give you that option to create an in-betweenness, to create a conversational situation, because there is a huge demand for more exhibitionary outputs? My interest within this conversation probably would have arrived at looking at exhibitions and the current relevance of this 'classic' format. What can this format do? I'm interested more in the reassessment of certain learning situations and figuring out how to resituate these experiences within the understanding of the contextual variables of the ongoing culturalpolitical changes and challenges.

Sarah Pierce Milica and Bassam, do either of you have thoughts that you want to put out at the end here? That's not an imperative.

Bassam El Baroni I've been very happy to listen to Pip, Milica, Lívia and yourself, and nothing comes to mind at the moment.

Sarah Pierce And Milica?

Milica Tomić Milica doesn't have any thoughts!

Sarah Pierce Well, thank you all so much. It's been a pleasure amidst the displeasures of late. I will be in touch with a written document, and we can talk more about how that works, but in general - returning to the beginning of the conversation - don't feel like you have to go deep into that document. I don't want to give you work to do - this was the work. You can look at what you've said and modify, but don't feel like you have to turn it into a collectively written tome.

Milica Tomić So we can just leave blank pages? Or black lines.

Pip Day Redacted!

Sarah Pierce You can redact it all. You can do Adrian Piper: 'I have nothing to contribute'.

This is Paper No. 18 in a series by The Metropolitan Complex that circulates as free publications.

Printed in an edition of 400. ISSN 2009-0455

The Metropolitan Complex Paper No. 18. was commissioned and produced by Project Arts Centre, Dublin with support from the Arts Council of Ireland and Dublin City Council.

The Metropolitan Complex is a project by Sarah Pierce.

 $in fo @ the metropolitan complex.com\\ www.the metropolitan com.com$